Kari Jimenez

From: Sharon Barton <smbarton1@me.com>
Sent: Thursday, September 1, 2022 11:06 AM
To: Kari Jimenez
Subject: Re: Item 5) D on the July 21, 2022 City Council Agenda: Public Record

Keri:

July 21, 2022 refers to an e-mail I sent to all City Council members on July 17, 2022. In reaching out to residents about tonight's public hearing (Sept 1, 2022) the 7-17-22 e-mail was distributed to Ivins residents. In response several residents requested their names be included to ENDORSE the email sent to City Council on 7-17-22 and OPPOSE the zone amendment listed as 4) A. on tonight's (9-1-22) agenda.

I apologize for the confusion.

Sharon Barton
smbarton1@me.com
503-803-1438

Sent from my iPhone

> On Sep 1, 2022, at 10:08 AM, Kari Jimenez <kjimenez@ivins.com> wrote:
>
> Good morning Sharon. Agenda item 5)D on the agenda tonight is not a Public Hearing. If an agenda item is not a Public Hearing, correspondence to the Mayor and Council is considered correspondence with the elected constituents and not public record. It appears that you are referencing agenda item 4)A, which is a Public Hearing. Please confirm.
>
> Thank you,
>
> Kari
>
> ---
>
> **From:** Sharon Barton <smbarton1@me.com>
> **Sent:** Thursday, September 1, 2022 9:24 AM
> **To:** Kari Jimenez <KJimenez@ivins.com>
> **Subject:** Fwd: Item 5) D on the July 21, 2022 City Council Agenda: Public Record
>
> Hi Kari:
>
> Please include the email sent to all City Council Members as public record.
>
> Thank you for your help.
>
> Sharon Barton
> smbarton1@me.com
> 503-803-1438

Begin forwarded message:

From: Sharon Barton <smbarton1@me.com>
Date: August 31, 2022 at 4:17:12 PM MDT
To: Lance Anderson <landerson@kayenta.net>, Adel Murphy <amurphy@ivins.com>, Jenny Johnson <jjohnson@ivins.com>, Dennis Mehr <dmehr@ivins.com>, Mike Scott <mwscott11@outlook.com>
Subject: Fwd: Item 5) D on the July 21, 2022 City Council Agenda

Dear Council Members

The email below was originally sent to all of you on 7-17-22. Since then it has been shared with several Ivins residents who have requested their names be included in endorsement of this email.

Ivins residents in opposition to Zoning amendment for SITLA 120

Sept. 1, 2022

Alan Schiff - Kayenta

B&L Douglas - Kayenta

Barb Ervin - SW Ivins

Beth Ann Jackman - South East Ivins

Billie Jean Irwin - Kayenta

Carolyn Reynolds - Heritage Estates

Carrie chandler - Kachina Springs

Cathy C. - Padre Canyon

Cherise Spencer. - Heritage Estates

Chris Haddad - South Central Ivins

Chuck Warren - Kayenta

Cindy Rupert - SW Ivins

CJ Koharcheck - South East Ivins

Craig Fife - South East Ivins

Dan Brown - Padre Canyon

Kari Jimenez

From: Sharon Barton <smbarton1@me.com>
Sent: Thursday, September 1, 2022 9:31 AM
To: landerson@kayenta.net; Adel Murphy; Jenny Johnson; Dennis Mehr; Mike Scott
Cc: Kari Jimenez
Subject: Additional endorsement

Please include the following names ENDORSING the 7-17-22 email sent by Sharon & Michael Barton to all City Council members and OPPOSING the Zoning Amendment for SITLA 120:

Daren & RaeBeth Barney: Padre Canyon

Please include this email for Public Record.

Thank you,

Sharon Barton
smbarton1@me.com
503-803-1438

Kari Jimenez

From: Sharon Barton <smbarton1@me.com>
Sent: Thursday, September 1, 2022 9:24 AM
To: Kari Jimenez
Subject: Fwd: Item 5) D on the July 21, 2022 City Council Agenda: Public Record

Hi Kari:

Please include the email sent to all City Council Members as public record.

Thank you for your help.

Sharon Barton
smbarton1@me.com
503-803-1438

Begin forwarded message:

> **From:** Sharon Barton <smbarton1@me.com>
> **Date:** August 31, 2022 at 4:17:12 PM MDT
> **To:** Lance Anderson <landerson@kayenta.net>, Adel Murphy <amurphy@ivins.com>, Jenny Johnson <jjohnson@ivins.com>, Dennis Mehr <dmehr@ivins.com>, Mike Scott <mwscott11@outlook.com>
> **Subject: Fwd: Item 5) D on the July 21, 2022 City Council Agenda**
>
> Dear Council Members
>
> The email below was originally sent to all of you on 7-17-22. Since then it has been shared with several Ivins residents who have requested their names be included in endorsement of this email.
>
> Ivins residents in opposition to Zoning amendment for SITLA 120
>
> Sept. 1, 2022
>
> Alan Schiff - Kayenta
>
> B&L Douglas - Kayenta
>
> Barb Ervin - SW Ivins
>
> Beth Ann Jackman - South East Ivins
>
> Billie Jean Irwin - Kayenta
>
> Carolyn Reynolds - Heritage Estates

Carrie chandler - Kachina Springs

Cathy C. - Padre Canyon

Cherise Spencer. - Heritage Estates

Chris Haddad - South Central Ivins

Chuck Warren - Kayenta

Cindy Rupert - SW Ivins

CJ Koharcheck - South East Ivins

Craig Fife - South East Ivins

Dan Brown - Padre Canyon

Dana Cook - South East Ivins

Dee Edmonds - Chancel Cliffs

Don Round - South East Ivins

Edward Ganz - SW Ivins

Ellen Nathan - Kayenta

Hans Wolters - Ivins

Helen Cavaletto - Base of Big Red Mountain

Howard Manwaring - Padre Canyon

Jamy Dahle - Ivins

Janeanne Gardner - SW Ivins

Janet Donnelly - Santa Clara Heights

Jeff Rupert - SW Ivins

Jennifer ("Xeni") Hamm - Kayenta

JeriLynn Round - South East Ivins

Jim B. - Base of Big Red Mountain

Joel Behr - Kayenta

John Bjerke - Kayenta

John Reed - Kayenta

Julie Dumas - South East Ivins

Karen Kushner -Kayenta

Karre Rossiter - Base of Big Red Mountain

Kathleen Gueymard - Kachina Springs

Kathrine Ward - South East Ivins

KayeLynn Van Wagenen - Ivins

Laela Gaylord - South Central Ivins

Lawrence Kushner - Kayenta

Leoni Muir - South Central Ivins

Lisa Ganz - SW Ivins

Ned Ganz - SW Ivins

Lois Hewitt - Kayenta

Lorilee Rawlins - South Central Ivins

Lorraine Reynolds - South East Ivins

Lynn Ward - South East Ivins

Marla Ranney - South Central Ivins

Melissa Bushman - Kayenta

Melissa Hamlett - Ivins

Michael Cook - South East Ivins

Mikel Hugo - South East Ivins

Mimi Webster - SW Ivins

Nathan Dupre - Kayenta

Nik Jackson - South East Ivins

Pamela Beard - Ivins

Patricia Milnamow - Kayenta

Randy Johnson - Ivins

Randy Wong - Base of Big Red Mountain

Robert MacFarlane - SW Ivins

Ron Craig - SW Ivins

Sally Tom - Ivins

Sarah Dunn - Kayenta

Sharon Aspenberg - Kayenta

Sharon Gillespie - Base of Big Red Mountain

Shauna Fisher - SW Ivins

Shawn Perkins - Vermilion Eagle Springs

Shelley Pulcini-Corso - South East Ivins

Sherry Breitenbach - South East Ivins

Steven Weida - South East Ivins

Susan Bithell - Base of Big Red Mountain

Teree Castanias - Base of Big Red Mountain

Teresa Fife - South East Ivins

Terese Schelling - SW Ivins

Terri Hagler - SW Ivins

Tim Gillespie - Base of Big Red Mountain

Timothy Rigby - Ivins

Twila Kay - Padre Canyon

Valerie Spink - Kayenta

Virginia Miller - Ivins

Ron Levandoski - Ivins

Marilyn Burke • Vermilion Eagle Springs

Chris Burke • Vermilion Eagle Springs

Robert Wiggins • Vermilion Eagle Springs

Ronda Page • Citadel Estates

Larry Page • Citadel Estates

Jan Farr • Base of Big Red Mountain

Richard Farr • Base of Big Red Mountain

Richard Tom • Ivins

Kathy Obray • Base of Big Red Mountain

Lyle Obray • Base of Big Red Mountain

Jerry Morben • Base of Big Red Mountain

Howard Manwaring - Padre Canyon

Eve Manwaring - Padre Canyon

William Mayol • South East Ivins

Jim Curcio • Chancel Cliffs

Kathy Curcio • Chancel Cliffs

Vicki Goldstein - SW Ivins

Adrienne Boudreaux - Santa Clara Heights

David Poffenberger • Base of Big Red Mountain

Connie Harris,• South Central Ivins

Chelsea Clarkson,• South Central Ivins

John Clarkson • South Central Ivins

Louie Goldstein - SW Ivins

Merlene Huggins • South East Ivins

Rex Huggins • South East Ivins

Elsie Phillips, South Central Ivins

Tracy Philips, South Central Ivins

Maralyn Whitney, South Central Ivins

Dennis Whitney, South Central Ivins

Regina Roper, South Central Ivins

Stephen Roper - South Central Ivins

Jerry Harris. South Central Ivins

Dean Rossiter - Base of Big Red Mountain

Karen Rossiter - Base of Big Red Mountain

Elizabeth Fortney - Kayenta

Karen Wolfe - Kayenta

Katharine Davis - Ivins

Glenn Davis - Ivins

Susan Jarvis • Ivins

Jeff Jarvis • Ivins

Debbie Ranck • Kayenta

Kevin Ranck • Kayenta

Jan Schroeder • Base of Big Red Mountain

Don Schroeder • Base of Big Red Mountain

Kari Revheim • Base of Big Red Mountain

Glenn Revheim • Base of Big Red Mountain

Barb Ervin • SW Ivins

Jon Ervin. • SW Ivins

David Farnsworth • Vermilion Eagle Springs

Richard Ranney • South Central Ivins

Jan Cox • Padre Canyon

Brad Cox• Padre Canyon

Jack Mladek • Kayenta

Connie Lewis • Base of Big Red Mountain

Richard Lewis • Base of Big Red Mountain

Sharon Jenkins • South Central Ivins

Patti LeBron • Ironwood

Nathan Dupre • Kayenta

Glenda Clifford • South Central Ivins

Jim Hanner • South Central Ivins

Sammi Tall • Kayenta

David Tall • Kayenta

Gwen Harrington • Kayenta

Cynthia Zullo • Kayenta

Daphne Schroth • Kayenta

Gene Schroth • Kayenta

Mikel Hugo • South East Ivins

Niki Hugo • South East Ivins

Susie Buecher • SW Ivins

Lori Harper • South East Ivins

Lisa Glines • Base of Big Red Mountain

Robert Glines • Base of Big Red Mountain

Sandie Ward • Kayenta

Corky Ward • Kayenta

Pamela Beard • Ivins

Gina Erickson • Kayenta

Steve Erickson• Kayenta

Sherry Ramuta • Ivins

John Ramuta • Ivins

Karla Hohn • South Central Ivins

Tatyana Goldberg • Kayenta

Igor Goldberg • Kayenta

Betty Blank • Kayenta

Mary Kay Soucy • Chancel Cliffs

Katie cuell • Downtown

Sara dupre • Kayenta

Emily Peters • Diagonal Street

Sunny PouquetteKayenta

Jim Pouquette - Kayenta

Joel Behr - Kayenta

Virginia Jones - South East Ivins

Emily Peters • Diagonal Street

Joni Bailey • Kayenta

Greg Bailey • Kayenta

Brian Comnes • Ivins

Barbara Comnes• Ivins

Sally Tom • Ivins

Jeff Larsen • Chancel Cliffs

Karen Larsen • Chancel Cliffs

Judi Southworth • Kayenta

Jim Southworth • Kayenta

Debra Lloyd • Ivins

SHIRL Lloyd • Ivins

Mimi Webster • SW Ivins

Les Light • SW Ivins

Terri Hagler • SW Ivins

Darren Walker • SW Ivins

Janelle Walker • SW Ivins

Fran Tonyan • SW Ivins

Laura Knowles • Chancel Cliffs

Dulce Clements • Chancel Cliffs

Terry Wong • Base of Big Red Mountain

Jan Bagdasar • SW Ivins

James Bagdasar• SW Ivins

Marcia DeLucchi • Base of Big Red Mountain

Marc Wong • SW Ivins

Mandy Wong • SW Ivins

Susan Brown • Southeast Ivins

Terese Schelling • SW Ivins

Jennifer Goodman• SW Ivins

Sharon Hokanson,• SW Ivins

Roger Nielsen - SW Ivins

Shelly Nielsen• SW Ivins

Susan Walker - SW Ivins

Jeff Walker - SW Ivins

Keith Walker - SW Ivins

Linda Walker - SW Ivins

Sharon Rose • Padre Canyon

Sharon Quillinan • Padre Canyon

Teree Castanias • Base of Big Red Mountain

Leslie Andrews - Base of Big Red Mountain

Craig Andrews - Base of Big Red Mountain

Adrienne Boudreaux • Santa Clara Heights

Diane Milecki • Ivins

Adam Milecki • Ivins

Kay Williams • Ivins

Sue Simonson – Reserve

Eric Simonson – Resreve

Ruth Webb - Kayenta

Roger Bryan – Ivins

Becky Clay – Ivins

Bob Clay – Ivins

Lindsey Brinkerhoff – Puerto Dr.

Julie Dumas – Padre Canyon

Mike Dumas – Padre Canyon

Ann Harrison – Reserve

Pieter Bowman – Puerto Dr.

Lance Allred – Red Rock

Ken Moore – Red Rock

Jan Bates – Ivins

Laurie Padgen – Puerto Dr.

Mark Padgen – Puerto Dr.

Shan Hansen – Ivins

Ann Ahee – Reserve

Jason Ahee – Reserve

Sandy Taylor – Puerto Dr.

Larry Taylor – Puerto Dr.

Steve & Mira Leffler: Copper Canyon
Shelley Moeller: Copper Canyon
Lynne Johnson: Copper Canyon
Don & Milja Harper: Copper Canyon
Irene & Kent Day: Copper Canyon
Brent & Jillyn Facer: Palisades
Connie Butterfield: Padre Canyon
Barry & Linda Neff: Palisades
Howard & Mary Beth Sierier: Padre Canyon
Jim & Connie Von Behring: Copper Canyon
John & Julie Dean: Red Mountain Estates

Begin forwarded message:

From: Sharon Barton <smbarton1@me.com>
Date: July 17, 2022 at 6:41:46 PM MDT
To: Mike Scott <mscott@ivins.com>, Lance Anderson <landerson@kayenta.net>, Adel Murphy <amurphy@ivins.com>, Dennis Mehr <dmehr@ivins.com>, Jenny Johnson <jjohnson@ivins.com>
Subject: Item 5) D on the July 21, 2022 City Council Agenda

Dear City Council Members:

Just like so many Ivins residents we are greatly concerned over agenda item 5) D: "Presentation and discussion on the Planning Commission's recommendation for a Zone Amendment per the Project Plan. Located at approximately Puerto Drive and 400 South." We were hopeful this agenda item would include a public hearing. Unfortunately it appears only the applicant will be allowed to participate while residents can not. Due to this, as residents we are submitting our concerns to all of you in this email. Thank you for your review and consideration of this e-mail.

In reviewing the Rize Capital presentation, (or Rise Capital/EWD as it appears on their presentation material at the May 17, 2022 and the July 5, 2022 Planning Commission meetings and at tonight's City Council Meeting), requesting the zoning amendment of the SITLA 120 acreage the following needs to be taken into consideration.

The current "Project Plan" submitted by Rize Capital is broken down into six (6) planning areas with a total of aprx 550 homes/units. The majority of the units are being built in Planning area 2B through Planning area 6. Based on the above stated projection of 550 units that would conservatively mean that 500 units would be "short term rentals." This type of plan represents a commercial project being built right in the midst of three established family-oriented neighborhoods. In comparison Sentierre in northeast Ivins and Black Desert Resort in far east Ivins are developing their own resort destination communities without infringing upon existing established residential neighborhoods. At the same time Sentierre and Black Desert Resort are adding high-end amenities that encourage people to come and invest, and enjoy their stay on the property. The Project Plan submitted by Rize Capital offers no sense of community just rental opportunities.. Trails and open spaces are being provided but that's a minimal

expectation for a resort destination. It is our understanding that Black Desert Resort and Sentierre will NOT be extending any use of their amenities to the Rize Capital over-night rental units aside from public trails, public restaurants and perhaps the BDR golf course if there are any available tee times.

A financial analysis was provided to the city by Zion Advisors and it shows a revenue to Ivins from Black Desert Resort over the next 30 years as $92 million with an associated expense of $7 million for a net revenue of $85 million. Certainly a nice financial benefit to the city. Some of this revenue in terms of sales tax and property tax will become available to Ivins as early as Sept 2022 when the first nine holes of the BDR golf course open for business.

In a BDR presentation at Red Mountain Resort Patrick Manning stated that all BDR/Ivins will be completed and operating by fall of 2025. The resort center will be finished fall of 2024 along with large portions of the golf village and family village. On April 5, 2022, Stan Castleton, representing Sentierre gave an updated and detailed report on Sentierre to the Planning Commission and Castleton estimated a portion of Sentierre would be open in aprx 2 years.

The "projected returns" on the Rize development shows a gross return to SITLA of $17,957,403 and an NPV of return of $10,471,105 over an absorption of 16 years. But what type of "returns" will Ivins City receive and how many years of aggressive construction will have to take place before the city recognizes any financial gain?

Perhaps it is time to take pause and consider that Ivins has reached its 'tipping point" and a zone amendment for resort commercial/resort mixed use with the majority of over-night rentals is not in the best interest of the city and our future. Instead Ivins should look at supporting the success of Black Desert and Sentierre, our two high- end resort destinations that are currently under construction. Rize is proposing 500 over-night rentals in an established neighborhood area - sounds very similar to Santa Clara's exploitation of over-night rentals. As City Council Member Dennis Mehr stated at the Sept. 19, 2019 City Council Meeting he was "not excited about recreating the Santa Clara nightly rental disaster." For SITLA and Rize there is a perceived financial gain but this type of over-night commercial development does very little to contribute to the growth of our future Ivins residents. Ivins can do better than this. As stated in the second paragraph of Ivins City General Plan: "THE PURPOSE OF THE IVINS CITY GENERAL PLAN IS TO STEER DEVELOPMENT TOWARD A WELL-CONCEIVED FUTURE PRESERVING THE CITY'S MAGNIFICENT NATURAL ASSETS AND DESIRABLE LIFESTYLE BY AVOIDING THE PITFALLS OF RECKLESS GROWTH." If Ivins' decides the city needs more over-night rental opportunities than the General Plan should be reviewed and revised. After that the Land Use Map should be reviewed and revised and finally zoning amendments should be considered. Please do not allow this "reckless" zone amendment recommendation made by the Planning Commission to become a "reckless" reality for our City.

Gregg McArthur the SITLA rep has stated SITLA will respect the decision made by Ivins City. Ivins is not a city of 500+ over-night rentals. We are a city of neighborhoods supported by well designed, all inclusive resort destinations such as Black Desert Resort Sentierre, Red Mountain Resort and Movara.

Sincerely,

Sharon & Michael Barton
571 Mesa Vista Dr
mebarton1@me.com
smbarton1@me.com
503-803-1438