IVINS CITY
PLANNING COMMISSION
MINUTES
October 3, 2023
435-628-0606

1) WELCOME AND CALL TO ORDER

CHAIRMAN AND COMMISSIONERS: The meeting was called to order at 5:30 p.m. All present included Chairman Dave Robinson, Commissioner Doug Clifford, Commissioner Pam Gardiol, Commissioner Derek Larsen, and Commissioner Perry Brown.
Staff Attending: Dale Coulam-City Manager/Attorney, Mike Haycock-Building and Zoning Administrator, Fred Castagne-Building Inspector and Sharon Allen-Deputy City Recorder.
Audience Attending: Jon and Nicole Graf, Jerry Armstrong, Sharon Gillespie, Sharon Barton, Bonnie Kline, Matilda Mylander and Lance Anderson, as well as others that did not sign in.

A. Acknowledgement of Quorum
B. Flag Salute-Commissioner Doug Clifford
C. Invocation-Commissioner Doug Clifford
D. Disclosures

Commissioner Derek Larsen stated he and a partner have a refundable deposit down on Black Desert Resort. No other conflicts.

2) REPORTS, PRESENTATIONS AND APPOINTMENTS-

Chairman Dave Robinson stated no official report, but two weeks ago Sharon Allen was honored at City Council for doing some continuing education and obtaining her MMC. We appreciate all the work she does for us. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated as the former director of that conference, she can tell the Commission that the work they need to do to earn their certification is impressive, so congratulations. Sharon Allen stated thank you. She loves working here.

3) PUBLIC HEARING AND ACTION ITEMS-

A. Public Hearing regarding a zoning text amendment to Ivins Code Section 16.17.211.(1) to increase the allowed total square footage of a single-family dwelling area within the clubhouse.

Dale Coulam stated that this came up as a concern of the plans not exactly meeting the terms of the RV Resort ordinance or the Conditional Use Permit. The Council seemed inclined to approve it and recognize that the intent behind the revised plan was to meet our roofline ordinance. When they modified their plans, the building became slightly larger, resulting in increased square footage larger than what the Conditional Use Permit allowed. It also increased the square footage allowed for a dwelling area on the second floor. What happened in drafting the ordinance, we had someone who wanted to do an RV Resort and the plans showed that the cabins around the perimeter were 1600 sq ft in size. The original clubhouse also showed 1600 sq ft for the office and a store on the first floor. The second floor single-family dwelling would also be 1600 sq ft. That was their plan and the plan changed to be larger than that. That square footage needs to increase in order to allow the modified plans and correct that problem. We have two public hearings to amend the section of the code living area on the second floor, and we can address two areas in the Conditional Use Permit on the next agenda item. **Mike Haycock** stated that the new plan shows there is a residence/manager's quarters along the northern portion and two

additional night/day shift assistant manager units on the southern part. They are live/work units and it has gone from one unit to three units with an extended footprint area. It is a 9000 total square footage clubhouse, the residential component is two 1200 sq ft units and one live/work area for the managers would be a total of 4183 sq ft. **Dale Coulam** made changes to the draft ordinance from single-family to say live/work units shall not exceed 4200 sq ft. This would limit the total size of the clubhouse with the Conditional Use Permit. So someone can't build a huge home within a clubhouse. That is why a maximum live/work area size is listed. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated would we want to do a percentage as well as an overall cap in the language? Jon Graf stated that the biggest reason we are here is we were doing a big barn-style building that was approved. Right after that, the City building inspector said you can't have anything more than 40 ft without an adjustment of the roofline. It was like 90 ft, so we changed it to the modern farmhouse look and popped out the roof in three different locations which gave us more square footage. So we decided we will have someone on-site 24 hours a day, so we have two day managers and a night manager and units for each one. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated in the original plan did you have these smaller units? Is the total area footprint smaller or larger than the original plan? Jon Graf stated no it didn't have those units before and the bathrooms for the pool area were required by the County Public Health Department and we added a storage room for tables and chairs, and that raised the square footage. **Dale Coulam** stated 5040 square feet was the original size. **Chairman Dave Robinson** opened the Public Hearing. **Fred Castagne** stated no one was on Zoom. Hearing no comments, **Chairman Dave Robinson** closed the Public Hearing.

B. Discuss and consider recommendation of a zoning text amendment to Ivins Code Section 16.17.211.(1) to increase the allowed total square footage of a single-family dwelling area within the clubhouse.

Commissioner Pam Gardiol stated that the numbers put in were based on this petitioner. Should we be putting those numbers in ourselves and the petitioner can align with that? **Dale Coulam** stated the Council wanted to approve the plans, so they instructed Staff to make the changes at Planning Commission to get a recommendation using those plans that went before City Council to bring it back to them for consideration. We are just following their instructions. **Commissioner Derek Larsen** inquired if Part One Resort-Mixed Use requirements where it states 50% of the commercial structure must have a residential component, are we keeping that section, or getting rid of that? **Dale Coulam** stated that is Resort Mixed-Use that states 50%. Part Two is regarding RV Resorts. **Chairman Dave Robinson** inquired if we feel a need to put percentages in there? **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated the only reason you maybe would is it would allow for a store to be included. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated the only value he sees in a percentage was if they build 1200 sq ft and they still want the residence at 4200 sq ft. Is that what we want or does it matter? **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated or a larger convenience store that would be for people that aren't even staying there. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated it just complicates it to add a percentage.

MOTION: Commissioner Doug Clifford moved to approve recommendation of a zoning text amendment to Ivins Code Section 16.17.211.(1) to increase the allowed total square footage of a single-family dwelling area within the clubhouse as edited in subparagraph one to read that the live/work area shall not exceed 4200 sq ft floor space within the clubhouse.
SECOND: Commissioner Perry Brown
VOTE: The motion carried.

Chairman Dave Robinson	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Derek Larsen	AYE
Commissioner Perry Brown	AYE
Commissioner Pam Gardiol	NAY

C. Public Hearing regarding amendments to the Hidden Springs RV Resort Conditional Use Permit to increase the allowed total square footage of the clubhouse and allowing the clubhouse height to be increased to 35 feet as allowed in the RC zone.

Dale Coulam stated the original structure was less than 35 ft high and the maximum height allowed in the Conditional Use Permit was what was shown in the original plan. But the maximum height allowed in the Resort Commercial zone is 35 ft. That is the first amendment to the Conditional Use Permit to make the clubhouse match the maximum height allowed. Another proposed amendment was that it was 5040 sq ft and now we want to allow at total of 9000 sq ft. All other terms and conditions set forth in the original list of conditions shall remain in force and effect. Those are the items listed in the first amended Conditional Use Permit. **Commissioner Perry Brown** inquired what was the original height? **Mike Haycock** stated 30 feet. Nicole Graf stated that the height of the roof went up when we had to add the dormers. That is the reason for the extra five feet. **Chairman Dave Robinson** opened the Public Hearing. **Fred Castagne** stated no comments on Zoom. Hearing no comments, **Chairman Dave Robinson** closed the Public Hearing.

D. Discuss and consider recommendation of amendments to the Hidden Springs RV Resort Conditional Use Permit to increase the allowed total square footage of the clubhouse and allowing the clubhouse height to be increased to 35 feet as allowed in the RC zone.

MOTION: Commissioner Perry Brown moved to approve recommendation of amendments to the Hidden Springs RV Resort Conditional Use Permit to increase the allowed total square footage of the clubhouse to 9000 square feet and allowing the clubhouse height to be increased to 35 feet as allowed in the Resort Commercial zone.
SECOND: Commissioner Doug Clifford
VOTE: The motion carried.

Chairman Dave Robinson	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Derek Larsen	AYE
Commissioner Perry Brown	AYE
Commissioner Pam Gardiol	NAY

4) DISCUSSION AND POTENTIAL ACTION ITEMS

A. Discuss and consider recommendation on a proposed Preliminary Plan for Black Desert Resort Boardwalk Village, located at approximately Snow Canyon Parkway and East Black Desert Drive. Enlaw, LLC-Owner. Stephenie Nast-Applicant.

Mike Haycock showed the parking garage and the structures above are a mixed use, of retail, residential, and office buildings. The parking garage will be their first phase of construction. In the future they may plat residential condo units but those depend on the type of tenants and use they get. The Snow Canyon viewshed is talked about in the Conditional Use Permit to comply with that view corridor. **Chairman Dave Robinson** inquired that the parking structure is underneath the surface, but it is structured around the buildings, so do the buildings go all the way down? **Mike Haycock** stated there is a thin layer of backfill going over it, but structurally it

is connected to the parking garage. The design calculations show a load that is continuous all the way through to the footings of the parking garage. Between the columns there will be dirt. **Commissioner Perry Brown** inquired that there are different color buildings being shown, how do they relate to what is being built right now? **Mike Haycock** stated that Black Desert Resort is below it. **Dale Coulam** inquired if Mike Haycock has seen a detailed plan of the parking garage so you can calculate the parking? **Mike Haycock** stated yes it is on the construction drawings and it is consistent with the parking calculations and the total amount given. **Commissioner Derek Larsen** stated the parking calculations are listed on the first page. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** inquired what is the height of these buildings and the sight line from Snow Canyon Parkway? **Mike Haycock** stated they meet the 15 degree view angle. The Conditional Use Permit and the Development Agreement both state they will meet that with detail about how tall buildings can be in each area. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** inquired so even if the topography changes, the sight line of the roof will stay the same? **Mike Haycock** stated with the 15 degree view angle they will get taller as they are further away. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** inquired so they will in fact be building three-story buildings, but the sight line of the roof will stay the same as what is near the Parkway? Will the view of the valley decrease or be eliminated when you are on the Parkway? **Mike Haycock** stated with a 15 degree view angle, they can get taller and it may reduce the view some, but no more as per ordinance. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated they won't be any taller than the hotel that is already going in. That will block a large section of what is blocked already. **Mike Haycock** stated you will be able to see the top of the hotel. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated if the hotel is blocking our view and other buildings are going in, the only saving grace is there is space between those buildings where you can see across the valley. **Mike Haycock** stated these are being built as per the ordinance. You may have some blockage in view corridors but it will meet the sight line. **Dale Coulam** stated as we visited the 15 degree view angle with Rocky Vista University, in order for them to get to the 35 feet height for a commercial building, that setback was about 100 feet back. These buildings start out smaller along the Parkway and get bigger and stay within that sight line and screened to not see the main resort center in the back. The hotel is what would block your view to the south. It will take them 100 feet to get to 35 feet. **Mike Haycock** stated the Conditional Use Permit and Development Agreement both state those pre-approved heights that they agreed to years ago. **Commissioner Derek Larsen** stated that when they flew the drone Buildings H and I were not visible above Building G. As you look from the Parkway the buildings stagger down. **Mike Haycock** stated that before family village is approved they will count parking spots as they don't have assigned parking. As they open buildings we will be sure they have the parking as they go and make sure they have additional spaces upon certificate of occupancy. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated that family village was going to have golf carts driving people to their units. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** inquired if the applicant was present? **Sharon Allen** stated they are not, but they were invited. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated he calculated 130 feet back to get to 35 feet.

MOTION: Commissioner Derek Larsen moved to approve recommendation on a proposed Preliminary Plan for Black Desert Resort Boardwalk Village, located at approximately Snow Canyon Parkway and East Black Desert Drive. Enlaw, LLC-Owner. Stephenie Nast-Applicant. Roll Call Unanimous.

SECOND: Commissioner Pam Gardiol

VOTE: The motion carried unanimously.

Chairman Dave Robinson	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Pam Gardiol	AYE
Commissioner Derek Larsen	AYE
Commissioner Perry Brown	AYE

B. Introduction of amendments to the Subdivision Ordinance.

Dale Coulam stated that this is an introduction to see what direction the Commission would like to proceed with this. He sent them a brief summary. Staff put together a total subdivision ordinance package that is revised. As indicated, Staff has recommendations that affect mostly the application and review process. To get to this revised ordinance Chapter Three titled Types of Subdivisions and Chapter 6 Phased Subdivisions have been eliminated, but parts have been incorporated into other sections of the new ordinance. If it is phased It will still require a Development Agreement. We are safe doing that under State law even though they restricted that on single-family developments. If they choose to phase it, they are choosing to have a Development Agreement. It is not being forced on them. We still recognize the various types of subdivisions. Our standard subdivision doesn't require a public hearing. We have a non-standard subdivision that has an overlay and does require a public hearing at Preliminary Plan. Cluster developments we allow to be incorporated into plans but it is really a Subdivision Enhancement Overlay where you can increase density in some areas and open space in others. Our subdivision ordinance over the years has morphed a little bit but we don't want to tackle that at this time. We don't want to bog this down because it needs to be passed by the first of the year. We don't have a meeting scheduled for Halloween so that makes the timeline tight. Chapter One-General Provisions has been rewritten. There was a page of provisions that should be and now are in a General Plan and should not be in a subdivision ordinance. General Plans are not ordinance. Chapter Three is the big one that needs to be passed. If you want to only proceed to replace the application and review process in Chapter Three that was Chapter Four previously, that is what needs to pass by the end of the year. That section is completely new and follows the new statute. Chapter Two had a few modifications in the definitions. There is a new definition of land use authority. City Council is no longer an administrative land use authority and no longer part of the subdivision process after the first of the year. As this is drafted he assumes the Planning Commission is still the land use authority for preliminary plans. City Council decides that. There is another yet-to-be named land use authority for final plats. We will have to define that and it can be a Planning Commission member or two, but it can't have three. That constitutes a quorum neither Planning Commission or City Council can be the land use authorities for final plats. It can have a staff member for final plat. It can be two or three staff members and no Planning Commissioner, or a Planning Commissioner and two staff members. Tom Jorgensen, who is our assistant City Engineer and Deputy Public Works Director, and Mike Haycock make a lot of comments at the Technical Review Committee. They make sure the final plat matches any changes noted from the Preliminary Plan. It is important to have that input from Staff. It would be beneficial to have a Planning Commissioner on that as a land use authority as well. We deleted the definition for Commission. It was unnecessary since we have a definition for what the Planning Commission is. We also deleted "Commission's authorized representative." We also struck "utility board." That is no longer a recognized body. We have Public Works that coordinates with the utility companies and so that board is no longer in existence. We modified some language in the concept plan because we can no longer require them, but they can request a pre-application meeting with Staff. He left the definition but modified it to meet that new term.

We modified "fee schedule" to "consolidated fee schedule." We modified the definition of Planning Commission because their function has changed a bit and language for the Zoning Administrator slightly as well. Chapter Four is the hands-off chapter, formerly known as Chapter Five. Design and Construction Regulations. He would recommend that in our review of the new subdivision ordinance we not touch that, and Staff will look at that in greater detail after the first of the year. We will get bogged down if we try to undertake looking at that chapter. Really what we need to pass is Chapter Three for the application and review process. The Commission needs time to review the totality of what the ordinance looks like, but we just won't touch the last chapter. He has given the Commission a copy of the new subdivision ordinance and Commissioner Pam Gardiol has read through it. He has not seen her changes. Next meeting discuss it and decide what moves forward to a public hearing. He has been sitting on this waiting for the General Plan to be completed, but continue to work on the General Plan and get that ready for another public hearing and focus on proceeding with the subdivision ordinance and the second meeting in November we will plan on a public hearing on whatever portion the Planning Commission decides to move forward. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated that she cannot read without editing so that is why she sent changes.

C. Discuss and consider recommendation on proposed amendments to the Ivins City General Plan.

Commissioner Pam Gardiol stated she got comments before the last meeting, but has not received many since then. She made her notes and remarks from those comments. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated that the Mayor put it in the October newsletter. There have been no comments added. The residents wanted more time to look at it but didn't have much to add from that, and then it went dark. **Mike Haycock** stated the State has disqualified us for Moderate-Income Housing because we are behind on our timeline. We now have 90 days to cure, which is being done with the General Plan moving forward. We have pressure on us to get this done. They haven't responded to his email yet. They want to see progress. We told them we would work on the General Plan and the land use plan, and then start on our goals. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated we hope we can be done sooner than 90 days. **Mike Haycock** stated time includes going to City Council also. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated we have given that opportunity so now we need to move forward. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated it is out to the public in draft form, and perhaps more comments will come in. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated there were interesting and helpful comments, even if there were not a lot of comments. We need to systematically go through those. There are some sections we need to address because there is continuing comments about certain areas that residents want us to pay special attention to. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated the draft went out prematurely because we hadn't addressed some of Commissioner Perry Brown's comments he had provided. Commissioner Doug Clifford also wanted to streamline it. We have those items on the table as we go through this. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated there are markups already in the plan. Let's start going through it. Add as we get to each section. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated it was suggested we pass this onto another team and let them finish it. That is not timely. In the final analysis it would not radically change the essence. It would give a more single focus in the writing style. You can by page tell who wrote what and there is redundancy. Strip out the similar content and context. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated at the beginning there was discussion about hiring this out and the Mayor said it was the responsibility of the Planning Commission and we are following in the direction we were given. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated it would be a budgetary matter to hire out as

well. We do need to streamline this. Table of contents has a yellow mark on General Plan Policies. Remove that highlight. Page 7 states on the last paragraph that the General Plan is an advisory guide for land use decisions, the impact of which shall be determined by ordinance. We are all fine leaving that in. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated that under "Purpose," the second sentence has "nearly half of its are as yet undeveloped". She recommends removing the percentage. General Plan Policies in the index should be changed to Page 8. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** crossed that section out. It does not add to the document. It complicates it. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated we need this document in a final form to review. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated that first highlighted section on General Plan Policies needs to not be bullets but a paragraph. Unhighlight "see city website." **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated on Page 9 Vision element C the word is "meet" rather than "met". **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated on Goal 3-Maintain a strong sense of place, he doesn't understand what that means. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated that phrase has become very common in social science literature in the last ten years. Move it forward. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated that on Vision Element E the comment she received was if it needs additional goals? Do we feel if everything we would want included is in there? Let's look at that. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated that also Vision Element F and Goal 12 he doesn't see how that supports the vision. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated that on Vision Element H Goal 14 we add "and protect our quality of life." It is not just about bringing in business, but the kinds of businesses we bring in protect our quality of life. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated that is a huge opinion. The gas station that people flipped out about, but is busy as all get-out. It looks good and it is done well. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated she disagrees it looks good. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated that Page 11 has "The goals indicated after each heading are those goals for which the policies under each heading are most relevant." **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated that is to explain what the goals mean after each element. That is the transition. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated that "also" is in bold. Just a typo. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated that land use element Goal 5 is red-lined. Those were additions. Page 12 the word "maximizing" should be "maximize". **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated on Page 13 he added this item because this comes out of our original elements, goals and policies. He didn't see it in any other area. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated it is applicable here. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated that is exactly the sentence we are talking about changing on Page 8 eliminating from the General Plan Policies. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated Policy 10 is almost the same as item number one. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated leave it in both so there is buffering in both commercial and residential. Add the wording of Policy 10 into number one. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated the use of the word "encourage" and in most cases we should use a different word to make it more of a directive. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated that is because this is not an ordinance. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated he understands that, but maybe there is another word. There are four in a row on this page. He can come up with some wording. **Commissioner Derek Larsen** stated maybe "encourage through ordinance and codes". **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated there are other ways to encourage as well. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated we tried to change that at the beginning, but these are guidelines and visions. Page 13 should say "moderate-income housing, and density bonuses." **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated that moderate should not be capitalized. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated take out the word "foster." **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated the other word is "establishes", not "established." Remove the word "out" from "rent out" on Page 13. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated remove "We will amend the land

use plan and set agendas for discussing solutions." **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated who is "we"? **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** inquired if this came from the State? **Mike Haycock** stated that is not from the State annotated. We did that by ordinance. **Dale Coulam** stated it may be a placeholder. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated take it out. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated "Actively encourage infill development to reasonably utilize urbanized areas and facilities. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated that came from the vision statement. General Plan Policies. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated that a comment she received was whether it should be "rural and urban" rather than "urbanized." She is good with it as it is. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated leave that in. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated on Page 14 in the list of following business, we already have a major assisted senior living area. It should get added to the list. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated she suggests a separate bullet. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated change the sentence "in addition to the growing Coyote Gulch commercial area, the Black Desert Resort/hotel/commercial center are being built" to "is being built." **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated on Page 14 of that section, remove "growing." **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated there are two other commercial areas that we have that are not listed here, like Lightfoot's, and Family Dollar. We identify the large ones and not others. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated remove that paragraph entirely. **Dale Coulam** stated end with the neighborhood commercial paragraph. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated the focus of supporting our resorts has been the plan for the last ten years and it has been executed well. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated Ivins being a resort community was put in place years ago and we won't be reversing that. We have to support the resorts that are here, and hopefully they create our tax base when construction ends. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** inquired if Item 6 on Commercial Business Policies is redundant? **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated she doesn't think so. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated that on Municipal Campus and Public Square Policies, we can un-highlight the Mayor's section, although he thought it was a moot point. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated take out the parks list. The General Plan is not a welcome wagon to where all the parks are. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated she agrees they can see the website for that information and we can remove it. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated we could maybe total the acreage of those parks. Open Space. Remove "Vision Element: Maintain a strong sense of place." **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated on Item 7 Elephant Rock, Humpback, etc. all in Kayenta. Kayenta is in Ivins and seems redundant. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated we are listing the parks again. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated we can write a statement to capture those eight bullets. We need to make an open space statement before the numbering. and take those bullets and turn them into a paragraph. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated we need to work on this one to make it consistent with formatting. She will give it a try summarizing that. Acquisition bullet on Pg 17 should say "space" rather than "spec." **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated under "methods that may help to preserve open space may include:" Can we eliminate that or streamline those definitions? **Dale Coulam** stated it is already in the subdivision ordinance. We don't need to define what has already been defined. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated leave the headings and get rid of the definitions. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated that on Page 18 the red-line is "With third-party permission, encourage developers to place existing and future power lines underground and remove existing poles where possible. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated he wanted to move to community appearance section. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated she wants it to stay. It is an important element of retaining open spaces, which is the ability to connect with the environment organically and spontaneously. **Commissioner Doug**

Clifford stated open space is by definition open. There are not lights there. It is not open fields causing the trouble. **Chairman Dave Robinson** and **Commissioner Derek Larsen** stated they agree to move it to Community Appearance. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated he wants a separate section for night sky. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated it is part of community appearance. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated he likes it in either. Item 8 maybe move to Item 3. **Commissioner Pam Gardiol** stated she moves to integrate it into Item 3. Commissioner Perry Brown suggested that Item 2 regarding TDR's stays. The City is listed on each one. We can polish those so the City is not listed each time. Page 19 Item 5 states "Establish and maintain friendly, mutually beneficial relationships with the Shivwits people," etc. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated it is listed as a goal somewhere but this is to establish and maintain these. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated it is not a public lands policy. He would eliminate Item 5. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated events is definitely not a public lands policy. **Commissioner Perry Brown** stated that all the material we are getting into now came from the old Chapter Four. They were the policies from there. We moved those to Appendix A and the policies have been inserted elsewhere. **Commissioner Doug Clifford** stated we tried to take the policies out of the Appendix, but they are currently still in there. **Chairman Dave Robinson** stated let's set up a work meeting for October 16th at 4 pm.

D. Discuss and consider approval of the Ivins City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes for September 19, 2023.

MOTION: Commissioner Perry Brown moved to approve D. Discuss and consider approval of the Ivins City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes for September 19, 2023.
SECOND: Commissioner Derek Larsen
VOTE: The motion carried.

Chairman Dave Robinson	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Derek Larsen	AYE
Commissioner Perry Brown	AYE
Commissioner Pam Gardiol	ABSTAIN

5) REPORTS
A. Planning Commission
B. Chairman
C. Building and Zoning Administrator, Mike Haycock

Mike Haycock stated that we have the subdivision ordinance. Movara has a preliminary plan. We may have another preliminary plan, and the concurrent zone change in Kayenta for Resort Commercial that was pulled a couple months ago.

D. City Manager/Attorney Dale Coulam
E. Items to be placed on future agendas.
6) ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Commissioner Derek Larsen moved to approve ADJOURNMENT
SECOND: Commissioner Doug Clifford
VOTE: The motion carried unanimously.

Chairman Dave Robinson	AYE
Commissioner Doug Clifford	AYE
Commissioner Pam Gardiol	AYE
Commissioner Derek Larsen	AYE
Commissioner Perry Brown	AYE